



BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION

In the matter of

Complaint No. PF. 8-(50526-P)- NEB (Legal)/DC-Isb-2017

NEB Department, PMC against Dr. Sultana Kanwal (B-50526-P)

Prof. Dr. Naqib Ullah Achakzai	Chairman
Prof. Dr. Noshad Ahmad Shaikh	Member
Mr. Jawad Amin Khan	Member
Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor	Secretary

Present:

Dr. Sultana Kanwal (50526-P)	Respondent
Hearing dated	10.10.2022

I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

1. NEB department forwarded the case against Dr. Sultana Kanwal (the "Respondent") before the Disciplinary Committee, Pakistan Medical Commission. Brief facts of the case are:
 - a) Respondent Dr. Sultana Kanwal applied for recognition of foreign basic qualification on 15.02.2007 and was issued eligibility certificate on 26.02.2007. She passed NEB examination held on 22.03.2007 and 10 & 11.04.2007 and was issued provisional

registration certificate on 02.05.2007 for House-Job. Dr. Sultana's provisional registration with the PMDC was extended from time to time till 01.05.2011.

- b) Subsequently, Respondent applied for permanent registration and alongside submitted a House Job certificate from Service Hospital, Lahore which was duly verified from the issuing authority. Similarly, the Consular section of the Embassy of Kazakhstan in Islamabad duly verified her M.D. degree.
- c) During the scrutiny of her application for permanent registration it transpired that Respondent had submitted two FSc certificates, one from the BISE, Sukkur (FSc, Pre-Medical) with 841/1100 marks and the other 'IBCC Equivalence Certificate of HSSC in Pre-Medical' with 712/1100 marks. Letters for verification were sent to the IBCC, Islamabad and to the BISE, Sukkur for verification of the certificates of the Respondent.
- d) Resultantly, verification of Equivalence certificate of HSSC (Pre-Medical) was received from Assistant Secretary IBCC with remarks "FOUND CORRECT". However, in response to letter for verification sent to BISE Sukkur, the designated officer of BISE Sukkur informed vide letter dated 26.01.2017 that the FSc certificate of Dr. Sultana from the BISE, Sukkur was "Verified and found BOGUS".

II. NOTICE TO RESPONDENT

2. In view of the above-mentioned circumstances, a Notice dated 17.02.2017 was issued to the Respondent doctor, directing her to explain her position regarding the submission of Bogus FSc Certificate.

III. REPLY OF RESPONDENT

3. The Respondent doctor submitted her reply to the Notice on 27.02.2017 wherein she contended that:
 - a) Respondent's father approached NEB Examination authorities and put forth a query before the concerned staff that equivalence of IBCC is under process of the Respondent and she had to appear for NEB. The staff communicated in case of requiring eligibility before equivalence, he would have to pay fee for the eligibility.

Respondent's father paid the fee and he provided the eligibility. Respondent appeared in the NEB examination and passed.

- b) I became registered and got registration certificate for one-year house job. After completion, I got one-year provisional registration. On the expiration of this registration, I applied for permanent registration, but didn't receive the same. Subsequently, I self-approached the office, and came to know that a certificate of FSc from Sukkur Board is attached with my file; which does not belong to me.
- c) Meanwhile, my husband forced me to Join the duty and practice but it was not possible due to non-issuance of my permanent registration. He divorced me. I am keeping the kid of 3-1/2 years of age and I am doing nothing for the last approximately 5 years. My all other documents are duly verified from the issuing authorities through your kind office.
- d) I have already been given an affidavit against the said certificate duly attested by the notary public dated 09/07/15 (copy attached). I also sent a letter to the registrar PM & DC on 26/02/2016 (copy attached)

IV. HEARING BEFORE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PMDC

4. After receiving written reply from the Respondent the matter was initially fixed before the Disciplinary Committee of *erstwhile* PM&DC on 05.04.2017. Respondent and her father Mr. Nawaz Asghar appeared before the Disciplinary Committee and were heard at length. The Disciplinary Committee, after hearing the matter observed and recommended as under:

"Respondent doctor (MD-2006 Kazakhstan) was issued provisional registration for house job after passing NEB examination held on 22nd March, 10th & 11th April, 2007 vide Roll No. 071287. The Committee was apprised that the applicant doctor's father had submitted a fake FSc certificate since there was delay in issuance of IBCC equivalence. The applicant originally secured 712/1100 marks in FSc Pre-Medical which is now duly verified by IBCC.

The applicant doctor's father admitted his mistake and sought apology on sympathetic grounds for the sake of his daughter's future.

During the personal hearing the respondent doctor's father informed that he bribed a person from PM&DC for this act, who he can identify upon seeing.

After studying complete details of the case the Committee unanimously directed the respondent to submit an affidavit narrating the complete story of bribing and names and contact details of persons involved in his assistance. On receipt of the above, proceedings of inquiry be initiated against the culprits involved. The doctor however shall be rendered apology and be issued permanent registration.”

5. The recommendations of the Disciplinary Committee were approved by the Council in its 187th Meeting dated 09.11.2018. The afore-mentioned recommendations were duly communicated to Respondent Dr. Sultana vide letter dated 24.12.2018 for compliance.

V. COMPLIANCE OF THE DIRECTIONS OF DC

6. Pursuant to directions of Disciplinary Committee, Dr. Sultana submitted her written apology through affidavit on 14.02.2019. Subsequently, Respondent submitted her Affidavit on 24.06.2022. The father of the Respondent, Dr. Nawaz Asghar also submitted his affidavit on 05.07.2022.

VI. HEARING BEFORE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PMC

7. The matter was again fixed for hearing on 10.10.2022. Notice dated 27.09.2022 was issued to Respondent Dr. Sultana Kanwal, directing her to appear before the Disciplinary Committee on 10.10.2022.
8. On the date of hearing, the Respondent was present in person. She submitted that she has complied with the earlier decision of the Disciplinary Committee and owns the contents of her Affidavit. Respondent requested that she should, therefore, be granted permanent registration in light of the approved decision of the Disciplinary Committee dated 05.04.2017.

VII. FINDINGS AND CONCLUSION

9. After perusal of the record and submissions of the Respondent, the Disciplinary Committee has observed that the Respondent had submitted an affidavit on 07.12.2021 conveying her written





apology. On 24.06.2022, the Respondent has also submitted an Affidavit in compliance of the earlier approved decision of the Disciplinary Committee dated 05.04.2017 narrating the whole course of events and names of employees involved in bribery. Further, the Respondent submitted that she will provide assistance during the course of any proceedings initiated against persons working at the Commission involved in bribing.

10. Father of the Respondent also submitted his notarized Affidavit on 05.07.2022 submitting that he shall be available to provide his assistance during any proceedings initiated by the Commission, whenever required.
11. The Disciplinary Committee notes that the Respondent and her father have submitted their respective Affidavits submitting the complete details of the events related to the registration at the erstwhile PM&DC. The approved decision of the Disciplinary Committee dated 05.04.2017, therefore, has been complied with by the Respondent.
12. In light of the fore-going, the Disciplinary Committee decides to accept the submitted Affidavit of the Respondent. Hence, the proceedings against the Respondent stand disposed of and permanent registration be issued to Respondent Dr. Sultana Kanwal.
13. Mindful of the facts of the present case, the Disciplinary Committee notes with grave concern, the involvement of the employee(s) of the PMDC/Commission, offering to procure fake documents/certificates in lieu of bribes. The Committee observes that the allegations of bribery against the staff of the PMDC/Commission, contained in the Affidavit of the Respondent, should be investigated.
14. Accordingly, this Committee directs that an inquiry should be conducted into the allegations of bribery by staff of the PMDC/Commission immediately. If the allegations are proved against personnel, stern action should be taken.



Prof. Dr. Noshad Ahmad Shaikh

Member

Mr. Jawad Amin Khan

Member

Barrister Ch. Sultan Mansoor

Secretary

Prof. Dr. Naqib Ullah Achakzai

Chairman

27th October, 2022