



**BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL
COMMISSION**

In the matter of

Complaint No. P.F.12-Comp-134/2017-legal

Mr. Khalid Mahmood vs Dr. Liaqat Ali

Mr. Ali Raza	Chairman
Mr. Aamir Ashraf Khawaja	Member
Dr. Asif Loya	Member

Present:

Maj Gen (R) Maqbool Ahmed	Expert (Surgery)
Mr. Khalid Mahmood	Complainant
Dr. Liaqat Ali	Respondent

I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND

Reference from Punjab Healthcare Commission

1. Mr. Khalid Mahmood (hereinafter referred to as the "Complainant") filed a complaint before the Punjab Healthcare Commission on 02-04-2015 whereby it was alleged that the Complainant took his son, who was suffering from abdominal pain and vomiting, to Ali Medicare on 08-03-2015 where Dr. Liaqat Ali (hereinafter referred to as Respondent) examined the patient and after the said examination, his dispenser (assistant) immediately started administering drips and injections which worsened the situation and resulted in



bleeding from the nose and loss of consciousness ultimately. Further, upon being inquired about the treatment, the Respondent and dispenser refused to intimate the situation to the attendants and the patient was referred to neurosurgeon at DHQ hospital Sahiwal where CT scan was conducted by Dr. Munawar Ali (surgeon) therefrom it was disclosed that brain veins got hemorrhaged. So keeping in view the serious condition, patient was further referred to Jinnah Hospital Lahore where patient died due to brain hemorrhage.

2. PHCC took cognizance thereupon and proceeded with the case. Expert in the field of medicine made the following observations:

“In my opinion the patient was suffering from acute dehydration following repeated vomiting due to certain infection which leads to cerebral venous sinus thrombosis as evidenced by the clinical course (fits and unconsciousness) and supported by CT findings of multiple hemorrhages in the brain which probably were hemorrhagic infarcts. The fulminant clinical course leads to the child’s death. The medication was given in HCE by the unqualified person without consulting the doctor which is illegal”

3. PHCCC referred the matter to PMC to take action against promoting the quackery. Being aggrieved of the decision of PHCCC both complainant and respondent assailed the decision passed by PHCC before the Court of District and Sessions Judge Okara where appeal of the Complainant was allowed but an appeal preferred by Respondent was dismissed with the direction to refer the case of Respondent to PMC. Moreover, Complainant also filed a separate complaint against the respondent before PMC alleging the Respondent of the allegations as stated above.

II. PROCEEDINGS OF DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF ERSTWHILE PMDC

4. Matter was taken up by the Disciplinary Committee 03-09-2019, however none of the parties appeared and the matter was adjourned.



III. DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE UNDER PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION ACT 2020

5. Pakistan Medical and Dental Council was dissolved on promulgation of Pakistan Medical Commission Act on 23 September 2020 which repealed Pakistan Medical and Dental Council Ordinance, 1962. Section 32 of the Pakistan and Medical Commission Act, 2020 empowers the Disciplinary Committee consisting of Council Members to initiate disciplinary proceedings on the complaint of any person or on its own motion or on information received against any full license holder in case of professional negligence or misconduct. The Disciplinary Committee shall hear and decide each such complaint and impose the penalties commensurate with each category of offence.

Hearing on 27-03-2021

6. The Disciplinary Committee held the hearing of pending disciplinary proceedings including complaint of Mr. Khalid Mehmood on 27-03-2021. On the date of hearing both parties; Complainant and Respondent were present.
7. Complainant reiterated his allegations against Dr. Liaqat Ali. The complainant stated that he took the child to the clinic of respondent at 6:00 am keeping in view that the clinic is nearby and is open 24 hours, as is advertised. The dispenser dealt with the child and started infusing drips. Later on, the doctor came but he did not examine the patient physically. According to Complainant he was generally in a good state, all he had was pain in abdomen and vomiting. After infusions of drips the child started deteriorating and became unconscious. The doctor then advised him to take his son to Sahiwal that wasted his three hours. Eventually after referral from Sahiwal to Jinnah Hospital Lahore, en route to Lahore the child passed away. He further alleged that Rs. 1800/- were taken by the Respondent for the treatment.
8. In response Dr. Liaqat Ali stated that patient was brought to his clinic in his absence at 6:00 am with history of severe abdominal pain and vomiting and was seen by the assistant who worked with him for 17 years. Infusion R/L, Inj Flagyl and Inj. Clafron was advised on phone before physically examining the patient. The Respondent reached the clinic at 8:00 am and he physically examined the patient and basic investigations were done. Afterwards, observing that



the patient is not recovering family was counselled about his seriousness. CT scan was advised and at 10:00 he was referred for the same. Later they went to another consultant who opined the same. Eventually referral was made to Sahiwal since CT-Scan facility was not available in the surroundings. CT Scan was done in Sahiwal that revealed the child had some brain disorder and from there they were referred to tertiary care facility in Lahore. The respondent also denied that he charged Rs. 1800/-. According to Respondent he charged only Rs. 750/-.

9. The Committee inquired from the Respondent regarding litigation status and whether he has filed an appeal against the order 08-03-2020 imposing a penalty of Rs. 200,000/- passed by Addl. District Judge, Okara to which the respondent responded that he has appealed the said order of Court.

Expert opinion by Maj Gen (R) Dr. Maqbool Ahmed

10. Maj Gen (R) Dr. Maqbool Ahmad who was appointed as an expert to assist the Disciplinary Committee in the matter. He has opined that:

“As per record the complainant brought his 13-year-old son and 0630 at 08 March 15 with history of severe headache and vomiting at Ali Medicare Okara. He was attended by Mr Shah Jaban (Assistant to Dr. Liaqat Ali) who after consultation with Dr. Liaqat Ali on telephone started IV fluids and antibiotics. The case was seen by Dr. Liaqat Ali by himself at 0800 hrs and advised to continue the treatment. The patient did not improve and suspecting some brain condition (and rightly so) the patient was referred to DHQ Hospital Sahiwal for CT scan brain and further treatment. The CT brain revealed brain hemorrhage. He was further referred to Jinnah Hospital Lahore by surgeon at DHQ Hospital and was found dead on reaching the Jinnah Hospital Lahore. In my opinion patient was suffering from congenital AV malformation which bled spontaneously resulting in intracranial hemorrhage and this explain all the symptoms.

The treatment provided at Ali Medicare was right and this did not lead to worsening of condition as claimed by the complainant. However, patient was attended initially by Mr Shahjahan who although started treatment after consultation with Dr. Liaqat Ali, was found to be unqualified. Moreover, the patient was seen by Dr. Liaqat Ali with one-hour delay for which he is hereby warned to be careful in future. Moreover, he should employ qualified nursing assistants.”



IV. FINDINGS/CONCLUSION OF THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE

11. The Committee has perused the relevant record, submissions of the parties and the expert opinion in the matter. Patient was brought to the clinic of the Respondent at 6:30 in the morning with the history of severe headache and vomiting. He was attended by Mr Shah Jahan who was assistant of the Respondent. The Assistant after consultation with Dr. Liaqat Ali on telephone started IV fluids and antibiotics. Respondent himself arrived at 8:00 am and advised to continue the treatment. The patient did not improve and suspecting some brain condition and rightly so the patient was referred to DHQ Hospital Sahiwal for CT scan brain and further treatment. The CT brain revealed brain hemorrhage. He was further referred to Jinnah Hospital Lahore by surgeon at DHQ Hospital and was found dead on reaching the Jinnah Hospital Lahore.
12. Based on the expert opinion, the Committee observes that the treatment provided at clinic of Respondent was right and this did not lead to worsening of condition. However, patient was attended initially by an assistant although he started treatment after consultation with Dr. Liaqat Ali. The Committee is conscious of the fact that no qualification of assistant has been provided except that he was working with the Respondent for last seventeen years. Moreover, the patient was seen by the Respondent with one-hour delay. The Committee observes that a dispenser is not capable of diagnosing the patient and starting the treatment in absence of doctor. Same observation has been in the court order passed by the Additional District Judge and accordingly the Respondent doctor has been penalized for authorizing an ineligible person to start treatment.
13. In view of above, the Disciplinary Committee is of the considered view that though the treatment/protocol was rightly observed and time was saved. It was however wrong on part of the Respondent to allow the dispenser to initiate treatment as he had an obligation to examine patient physically himself before treating the patient and that too under his supervision. Therefore, Respondent Dr. Liaqat Ali is reprimanded for lack of professional behavior and a penalty of PKR 50,000 (Fifty Thousand Rupees) is imposed on him.



Accordingly, the Respondent Doctor is directed to pay the fine amount in the designated bank of the Commission within fourteen (14) days from the issuance of this decision and forward a copy of the paid instrument to the office of the Secretary to the Disciplinary Committee, failing which license of the Respondent doctor shall be deemed as suspended and remain suspended until such time the fine is paid.

14. Respondent doctor is further directed to be careful in future and manage the timings of clinic as per his availability at the clinic for consultation and treatment of patients. Moreover, he is directed to employ only qualified nursing assistants.
15. The subject proceedings stand disposed of in terms of above directions.

Mr. Aamir Ashraf Khawaja
Member

Dr. Asif Loya
Member

Muhammad Ali Raza
Chairman



31st May, 2021