



**BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION**

**In the matter of**  
**Complaint No P.F-Comp-149/2017-legal**  
**Government of Punjab vs Dr. Nusrat Naz etc.**

Mr. Ali Raza	Chairman
Mr. Aamir Ashraf Khawaja	Member
Dr. Asif Loya	Member

*Present:*

Dr. Shajee Siddqi	Expert (Medicine)
Dr. Nusrat Naz	Respondent

**I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND**

**Reference from Punjab Health Care Commission**

1. The Punjab Health Care Commission sent a reference to disciplinary Committee of erstwhile PMDC in the matter of under trial prisoner admitted in Central Jail, Kot Lakhpat, Lahore. The said under trial prisoner was referred to Punjab Institute of Cardiology for her cardiac ailment



but management of Punjab Institute of Cardiology referred back the under-trial prisoner on both occasions after conducting some investigations. During the night between 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> of November 2014 the said prisoner suffered from shortness of breath and on call WMO, observing that she was BP less and pulseless, referred her to Jinnah Hospital, Lahore for medical treatment but she passed away on way to the Hospital.

2. The matter of death was inquired by Chief Minister's Inspection Team (CMIT) through Vice-chancellor King Edward Medical University, Lahore and Member General-V, who recommended that the decision taken at Punjab Institute of Cardiology to be referred to Punjab Health Commission with the cardiologist on board to fix and apportion the responsibility as to why the patient was discharged twice without realizing severity of her ailment in context of her suggestive history. The above said recommendations were approved by Chief Minister, Punjab in a summary initiated by CMIT.
3. Punjab Health Care Commission after conducting the hearing and recording of the evidence, decided the case vide decision dated 07-03-2017 and reference was sent to erstwhile PMDC to proceed against Dr. Nusrat Naz for not performing her duties diligently and not sending the patient to OPD of Punjab Institute of Cardiology as was advised by specialty hospital. Concluding para of the said decision by PHCC in relevant parts is reproduced hereunder for ease of reference:

*“After considering all the available record, facts, circumstantial evidence, and expert opinion the Board after detailed deliberation has decided that:*

- a. *The Healthcare Establishment i.e. Punjab Institute of Cardiology is exonerated from the charges of medical negligence. However, Board of Management of PIC is directed to develop and implement the SOPS for recognition, registration, and management of medico legal patients.*
- b. *The recommendations of Chief Minister's Inspection Team (CMIT) for proceedings against Dr. Nusrat Naz under PEEDA Act, 2006 is endorsed and her case is referred to PMDC for not performing her duties diligently and not sending the patient to OPD*



*of PIC, as was advised by the specialty hospital and thus wasted the crucial time for the treatment and management of the patient.*

### **Reply of Respondent Doctor Nusrat Naz**

4. Respondent doctor Nusrat Naz submitted her reply vide letter dated 08-08-2017 and she submitted that the decision is totally against the letter and spirit of Chief Minister's Inspection Team (CMIT) and Prof of Medicine who clearly blamed Punjab Institute of Cardiology Team. The cardiologist on board (who is unknown to us and we did not confront him even on table to counter questions before this decision). It is evident he has totally favored his cardiologic fraternity of Punjab Institute of Cardiology and on purpose has deliberately tried to save them and has unjustly put all the burden on the innocent doctors of the jail. She didn't get any intimation to send the patient to OPD-PIC. The night doctor and jail personnel didn't communicate this to her and as customary, the record lay in the hospital of jail on (male side). She performs her duty in female side (mini-dispensary). The patient was again sent (referred on 5/11/2017) to PIC, and they sent the patient back saying 'No active cardiac issue'."

### **II. PROCEEDINGS OF DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF ERSTWHILE PMDC**

5. Matter was taken up by Disciplinary Committee in its meeting held on 29-06-2019 at Pearl Continental Hotel, Lahore. The matter was adjourned as both of the parties failed to appear before the Committee.

### **III. DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE UNDER PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION ACT**

6. Pakistan Medical and Dental Council was dissolved on promulgation of Pakistan Medical Commission Act on 23 September 2020 which repealed Pakistan Medical and Dental Council Ordinance, 1962. Section 32 of the Pakistan and Medical Commission Act, 2020 empowers the Disciplinary Committee consisting of Council Members to initiate disciplinary proceedings on the complaint of any person or on its own motion or on information received against any



full license holder in case of professional negligence or misconduct. The Disciplinary Committee shall hear and decide each such complaint and impose the penalties commensurate with each category of offence.

### **Hearing on 27-03-2021**

7. The Disciplinary Committee held the hearing of pending disciplinary proceedings including this reference sent by the Punjab Health Care Commission. On the date of hearing Respondent Dr. Nusrat Naz was present.
  
8. During the hearing Respondent was enquired about the routine protocol at jail to treat prisoner patient who comes with chest pain. The Respondent was not able to answer satisfactorily. The Committee further asked her about her experience which she replied that in the beginning of her career she worked at social security and then for an NGO. She also informed the Committee that she has not done house job in medicine. During her house job period she worked in gynecology department for six months and then radiology department for another six months. She further stated that she was terminated after the enquiry in this case and is not continuing her medical practice.

### **Expert opinion by Dr. Shahjee Siddiqi**

9. Dr. Shajee Siddiqi was appointed as an expert to assist the Disciplinary Committee. He has opined:

*A female under trial prisoner Mrs. Ulfat Bibi wife of Muhammad Iqbal 40 years old was admitted in central jail Kot Lakhpat Lahore on 25-10-2014. The said under trial prisoner was referred to Punjab Institute of Cardiology Lahore for cardiac ailment twice. But from PIC patient was referred back on both occasion after conducting some investigation. During the night of 7<sup>th</sup> and 8<sup>th</sup> November 2014, the said prisoner had shortness of breath. the on call WMO observing the*



*BP les and pulseless referred to Jinnah hospital Lahore for medical assessment but patient passed away on way to hospital.*

*From the record it seems the prisoner patient had acute coronary syndrome resulting in demise of patient.*

#### **IV. FINDINGS/ CONCLUSION OF THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE**

10. The Committee has perused the relevant record, submissions made by the respondent and the expert opinion. It is observed that the prisoner patient had several visits to hospital of jail. She was encountered with some serious issue which was not diagnosed and assessed in line with treatment protocol. Respondent doctor Nusrat Naz was not able to make assessment of the patient and treat her or refer her to appropriate medical facility. The Committee is of the view that right approach towards the management of the patient could have saved the life of patient.
11. During the course of hearing the Respondent was not able to answer satisfactorily to the queries of expert on protocol to be followed to treat patients. She has made a statement before the Committee that she has not done house job in medicine. During her house job period she worked in gynecology department for six months and then radiology department for another six months. She further stated that she was terminated after the enquiry in this case and is not continuing her medical practice.
12. In view of above, Committee is of the considered opinion that Dr. Nusrat Naz does not possess sufficient skills required to practice as a practitioner. Further, since her termination from the hospital of Central Jail, Kot Lakhpat she is not practicing medicine. Therefore, the Committee decides that license will be marked as 'inactive' with immediate effect. However, if she wishes to get into practice and desires her license be made active again, she will have to undergo one year training for medicine at a tertiary hospital. Further, she will submit the compliance report with the request to mark her license as 'active'.



13. The subject proceedings stand disposed of in terms of above directions.

**Mr. Aamir Ashraf Khawaja**  
Member

**Dr. Asif Loya**  
Member

**Muhammad Ali Raza**  
Chairman



28<sup>th</sup> April, 2021