



**BEFORE THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION**

**In the matter of**

**Complaint No 116/2016-legal**

**Mr. Muhammad Nawaz Siddiqui Vs Dr Muhammad Naveed and Surayya Azeem Hospital,  
Lahore**

Mr. Ali Raza	Chairman
Mr. Aamir Ashraf Khawaja	Member
Dr. Asif Loya	Member

*Present:*

Maj Gen (R) Maqbool Ahmed	Expert (Surgery)
Dr. Naveed Nawaz Siddiqui	Respondent

**I. FACTUAL BACKGROUND**

**Reference from Punjab Health Care Commission**

1. A reference was sent on 03-10-2016 to disciplinary Committee of erstwhile PMDC by the Punjab Health Care Commission in the matter of complaint filed by Mr. Muhammad Nawaz Siddiqui (hereinafter referred to as the Complainant”) against Dr. Muhammad Naveed (hereinafter referred to as the “Respondent Doctor”) and Surayya Azeem Hospital, Chaburji (hereinafter referred to as the “Respondent Hospital”). Brief facts of the case are that on 25-10-2014, the Complainant’s sister/patient slipped from the stairs at her home, resultantly her hip bone was fractured. The patient went to Respondent Hospital on 27-10-2014. The patient was admitted under the care of Respondent Doctor. The operation of the patient was deferred for 7-8 days for pre-operative investigations which came out to be within normal limits.



Elective surgery was planned for 003-11-2014. On the night of 2- 11-2014 they were asked to arrange blood which according to the complainant was a direction that should have been given well before time. However, two pints of blood (8-10 days old) was arranged and consent for surgery was given by the Complainant that in case of any infection the doctor will not be responsible. The operation started at 2:00 pm and lasted for three hours. At 5.00 pm patient became conscious, her breathing was not being restored and her condition appeared to be serious. According to the Complainant there were no doctors present for patient's postoperative care till midnight, after which a doctor (name unknown) verbally ordered to shift the patient to Punjab Institute of Cardiology on a suspicion of a heart problem. As per complainant, no ambulance was provided, operation was performed negligently and the management had suspected patient's grave condition therefore she was shifted to Punjab Institute of Cardiology only to save their skin. Upon reaching Punjab Institute of Cardiology, it was revealed that there was no heart problem. She was then moved to Farooq Hospital, Iqbal Town, Lahore where she remained on a ventilator and passed away.

2. The matter was taken up by the Punjab Health Care Commission. The Board noted that as per the death certificate, the patient/deceased developed Acute Respiratory Distress Syndrome (ARDS) and sepsis. The Board further noted that Surayya Azeem Hospital is a 150 bedded hospital. There were clear flaws in the management of the patient as admitted by the hospital. There was no evidence of pre-operative evaluation and advice regarding the treatment of the patient by a physician. The patient's file was poorly documented and no immediate post-operative care was given. Moreover, a cardiologist was not arranged rather the patient was referred to another hospital. In view of this the hospital has clearly committed an offence of maladministration. Further the matter of the hospital was referred to PMC for reconsideration of hospital for its affiliation as teaching hospital.

## **II. PROCEEDINGS OF DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE OF ERSTWHILE PMDC**

3. Matter was taken up by Disciplinary Committee of erstwhile PMDC in its meeting held on 30-06-2019. None of the parties show up and proceedings were adjourned till next.

## **III. DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE UNDER PAKISTAN MEDICAL COMMISSION ACT**



4. Pakistan Medical and Dental Council was dissolved on promulgation of Pakistan Medical Commission Act on 23 September 2020 which repealed Pakistan Medical and Dental Council Ordinance, 1962. Section 32 of the Pakistan and Medical Commission Act, 2020 empowers the Disciplinary Committee consisting of Council Members to initiate disciplinary proceedings on the complaint of any person or on its own motion or on information received against any full license holder in case of professional negligence or misconduct. The Disciplinary Committee shall hear and decide each such complaint and impose the penalties commensurate with each category of offence.

#### **Hearing on 27-03-2021**

5. The Disciplinary Committee held the hearing of pending disciplinary proceedings including complaint of Mr. Muhammad Nawaz Siddiqui on 27-03-2021. On the date of hearing Respondent doctor was present. However, the Complainant was not absent. Also, no one appeared on behalf of Suraya Azeem Teaching Hospital who were on notice.
6. On enquiring about the case, the Respondent doctor stated that pre-op assessment was done. Patient was not a high-risk patient. Pre-operative assessment seemed normal including ECG was normal. Th patient had developed complications during surgery. Anticoagulation therapy however was not started and patient was not assessed and seen post operatively by him. After the surgery she was referred to Punjab Institute of Cardiology by some other doctor as a cardiologist was not available in the teaching hospital and record of Surraya Azeem Hospital is also missing.

#### **Expert opinion by Maj Gen (R) Dr. Maqbool Ahmed:**

7. Maj Gen (R) Dr. Maqbool Ahmad was appointed as an expert to assist the Disciplinary Committee in the matter. He has opined that:

*“As per record, sister of complainant sustained fracture neck of femur on 25/10/14 and was admitted on 27/10/14 at Surayya Azeem Hospital. She was operated after 1 week on 3/11/14. Post operatively she wasn't seen by operating doctor and was referred to PIC by some other doctor suspecting some cardiac problem. She was investigated at PIC and was found having no cardiac problem. She was then shifted to Farooq Hospital Iqbal Town Lahore where she was put on ventilator and expired.*”



*In my opinion the operating doctor didn't properly investigate the case pre operatively especially to rule out venous thrombosis/ embolism. He did not see her post operatively Surayya Azeem Hospital which is a teaching hospital didn't have a Cardiologist and patient was unnecessary shifted to PIC. The Surayya Azeem Hospital should be instructed to complete their faculty immediately and Dr. Mohammad Naveed should be warned to investigate the cases properly before undertaking surgery.”*

#### **IV. CONCLUSION FINDINGS OF THE DISCIPLINARY COMMITTEE**

8. Based on the facts of the case and expert opinion, the Committee observes that the Respondent admittedly failed to provide the necessary post operative care expected of a consultant and left the matter to the hospital. The Respondent admitted that complications had arisen during the operation and which therefore, even more so necessitated the Respondent to follow up the patients post operative care period. The complications which arose thereafter, and which resulted in the probable death of the patient may have been avoided had proper post operative care been provided by the Respondent and the hospital. As a result the Committee finds that the Respondent failed in his duty of care and professional obligation to follow up the patient during the post operative period. On account of such failure by the Respondent, the Respondent's license is suspended for a period of 6 months.
9. The allegations mentioned in the compliant also specifically refer to lack of facilities and poor management on part of the hospital, which is a teaching hospital accredited by the Commission. The Respondent doctor has admitted during the hearing that post- operative care was not provided properly by the hospital notwithstanding that he himself had not see the patient post -surgery. No other doctor was present for patient's postoperative care till midnight.
10. The Committee further observes that when the patient's condition deteriorated and a heart attack was suspected, no cardiologist was available at the hospital to examine the patient. After which attendants were told to shift the patient to Punjab Institute of Cardiology. She was investigated at Punjab Institute of Cardiology and was found having no cardiac problem. She was then shifted to Farooq Hospital, Iqbal Town Lahore where she was put



on ventilator and expired. Patient was unnecessarily shifted to Punjab Institute of Cardiology for the reason that no relevant doctor was available at the Respondent Hospital and she was not given the right treatment to save time which deteriorated her condition.

11. The Committee found that no records of the hospital viz the patients treatment were produced and the hospital elected not to appear at the hearing even.
12. In view of above, the Disciplinary Committee is of the considered view that the lack of facilities and management available at the Respondent Hospital which is 150 beds hospital places its status as a teaching hospital in serious question. There is no proper medical record keeping at the hospital. Adequate staff and doctors such as cardiologist are not available as found in the instant case. Post-operative care facility which is essential to ensure recovery of patient and avoid any complication has not been ensured at the hospital. Therefore, the status of Surayya Azeem Hospital as an accredited teaching hospital with the Commission is placed on probation and the Authority is directed to form a special committee to inspect the hospital without prior notice and if the hospital is found wanting in its mandatory or minimum standards, the status of the hospital as an accredited hospital be suspended and appropriate action be initiated to de notify the accreditation of the teaching hospital.
13. The subject proceedings stand disposed of in terms of above directions.

**Mr. Aamir Ashraf Khawaja**  
Member

**Dr. Asif Loya**  
Member

**Muhammad Ali Raza**  
Chairman



28<sup>th</sup> April, 2021